

EXHIBIT

A

Project Update

The Traffic Mobility Review Board (TMRB), the six-member panel that will issue a recommended tolling structure for the CBD Tolling Program, met on Wednesday, July 19, 2023. View a [recording of the meeting](#), or see [the presentation](#). The TMRB will hold a second meeting on Thursday, August 17, from 3:00 – 4:00 p.m. at MTA Headquarters (2 Broadway, 20th Floor, New York, NY). In accordance with open meetings law, the meeting will be open to the public and the media, and will be livestreamed by the MTA. The meeting does not include a public comment period.

In June 2023, the Federal Highway Administration (FHWA) issued a Finding of No Significant Impact (FONSI) for the CBD Tolling Program. [Read FHWA's finding.](#)

Contractors have up to 310 days from this approval to complete the design, development, testing, and installation of the tolling system and equipment, and the TBTA Board must adopt a toll structure, before toll collection can begin.

How the Central Business District Tolling Program Will Work

The Central Business District (CBD) Tolling Program will be the first congestion pricing program in the United States. The Environmental Assessment, which the United States Department of Transportation's Federal Highway Administration required, looked at the environmental effects of the program. Congestion pricing has helped other cities around the world and we believe it will also help the people who visit, live, or work in the New York City metropolitan region. By reducing traffic and helping improve mass transit, the CBD Tolling Program will also make it faster to travel and improve air quality.

Vehicles that enter or remain in the Central Business District will be tolled. The toll will be paid using an E-ZPass. If you do not have an E-ZPass, toll bills will be mailed to the address of the registered vehicle owner and are paid using Tolls by Mail.

<https://new.mta.info/project/CBDTP>



Rendering of a proposed mast arm housing tolling infrastructure and tolling system equipment over the roadway at Broadway between 60th and 61st Streets

When and How Toll Amounts Will Be Decided

In April 2019, the state enacted the MTA Reform and Traffic Mobility Act (the Act), which states that the MTA's Triborough Bridge and Tunnel Authority (TBTA) needs to design, develop, build, and run the Central Business District (CBD) Tolling Program.

There are three ways that the tolls will be set:

1. The Act says the CBD Tolling Program must:

- Charge passenger vehicles only once each day for entering or remaining in the Central Business District
- Change the toll rates at set times or days; this is called variable tolling
- Allow residents of the CBD making less than \$60,000 to get a New York State tax credit for CBD tolls paid
- Not toll qualifying authorized emergency vehicles and qualifying vehicles transporting people with disabilities

2. Commitments made in the Final EA will be included:

- Taxis and FHV's will not be tolled more than once daily
- The overnight toll will be at or below 50% of the peak toll from at least 12-4am
- There will be a discount for frequent low-income drivers

3. A Traffic Mobility Review Board (TMRB) will recommend toll rates to the MTA's TBTA Board, which has final say on what the rates can be. The TMRB must think about many things before it can recommend toll rates, including:

- How traffic might move
- Air quality and pollution
- Costs
- Effect on the public
- Safety

The Act also says the TMRB will need to recommend a plan for credits, discounts and/or exemptions for:

- Tolls paid the same day on bridges and tunnels
- Some types of for-hire vehicles

Once the TMRB recommends the toll rates, TBTA would then follow its process for setting tolls, which includes a public hearing. That final decision on tolls would include:

- The toll for each type of vehicle
- How and when the tolls would change
- Any other credits, discounts and/or exemptions

Traffic Mobility Review Board

The Triborough Bridge and Tunnel Authority (TBTA) Board establishes the TMRB and names its chair and five members. As established by the [MTA Reform and Traffic Mobility Act](#) (the Act), one member will be recommended by the Mayor of the City of New York, one member will reside in the Metro-North Railroad region, and one member will reside in the Long Island Rail Road region.

The TMRB was [approved by the TBTA Board on July 27, 2022](#) and consists of the following six members:

- Carl Weisbrod, Chair of the TMRB and former Chair of the City Planning Commission and Director of the New York City Department of City Planning
- John Banks, President Emeritus of the Real Estate Board of New York
- John Durso, President of the Long Island Federation of Labor ([appointed June 21, 2023](#))
- John Samuelson, International President of the Transport Workers Union

- Elizabeth Velez, President and Principal of the Velez Organization
- Kathryn Wylde, President and CEO of the Partnership for New York City

The TMRB met on Wednesday, July 19, 2023. View a [recording of the meeting](#), or see [the presentation](#). The TMRB will hold a second meeting on Thursday, August 17, from 3:00 – 4:00 p.m. at MTA Headquarters (2 Broadway, 20th Floor, New York, NY). In accordance with open meetings law, the meeting will be open to the public and the media, and will be livestreamed by the MTA. The meeting does not include a public comment period.

Our Public Transit Needs Investment

Public transit is important to the New York City metropolitan region. Before COVID-19, more than 75% of trips into the area south of 60th Street in Manhattan were made by bus, subway, commuter railroad, or ferry. The millions of people living in the New York City metropolitan region need easy transit options. Problems in the system cause people to be late to work; miss medical, school, and other important appointments; and to spend more time away from family.

MTA ridership had increased nearly 50% in the 20 years before COVID-19. At the same time, the money invested in the MTA for public transit improvements fell by 8%. The MTA needs a regular source of money for its 2020-2024 Capital Plan, which identifies \$52.0 billion of investments in the region's subways, buses, and commuter railroads. The revenue from the Central Business District (CBD) Tolling Program will help maintain and modernize the existing transportation system, and help provide more capacity, reliability, and accessibility. It will also help low-income and minority communities.

After paying the cost of running the CBD Tolling Program, 80% of the money will be used to improve and modernize New York City Transit, which runs the subway system and buses; 10% will go to Long Island Rail Road, and 10% to Metro-North Railroad. A regular source of money from the CBD Tolling Program that can be used only for subway, bus, and commuter railroad projects will help make them all faster, more accessible, and more reliable for everyone.

Benefits of Central Business District Tolling Program

The Central Business District Tolling Program can deliver many benefits for New York City, including:

- Reduced traffic in and around the Manhattan CBD
- A regular source of money to improve and modernize MTA subway, bus, and commuter railroads
- Better air quality

- Promoting equity by providing expanded access to the transit system
- Reduced travel times

The Central Business District Tolling Zone

The Central Business District Tolling Zone will cover 60th Street in Manhattan and all the roadways south of 60th Street, except for:

- FDR Drive
- West Side Highway/9A, Battery Park Underpass, and any surface roadway portions of the Hugh L. Carey Tunnel connecting to West Street

New York City CBD Tolling Zone

Environmental Justice Communities

Federal agencies, including the Federal Highway Administration (FHWA), are required to consider whether their proposed actions would result in disproportionately high and adverse effects on minority and/or low-income populations (also known as environmental justice populations) and, if any, to address as appropriate. This includes providing opportunities for full and fair participation by all potentially affected communities.

The United States Department of Transportation and FHWA essentially define minority and low-income individuals and populations for this purpose as follows:

- **Minority:** a person who is Black, Hispanic or Latino, Asian American, American Indian, Alaskan Native, or Native Hawaiian or Other Pacific Islander.
- **Low-Income:** a person whose household income is at or below the United States Department of Health and Human Services poverty guidelines. For the purpose of the Central Business District Tolling Program (CBD Tolling Program) Environmental Assessment, low-income persons were considered those in households with incomes up to twice the Health and Human Services poverty guidelines.
- **Population:** any readily identifiable group of minority and/or low-income persons who live in geographic proximity, and, if circumstances warrant, geographically dispersed/transient persons of those groups who will be similarly affected.

The New York Metropolitan region is home to a diverse population and includes many communities and neighborhoods where minority and low-income populations live and work. The study area for the Central Business District Tolling Program (CBD Tolling Program) includes New York City; Long Island; counties north of New York City; portions of southern Connecticut; and portions of northern and central New Jersey.

- 52% of the study area identify themselves as minority
- 28% of the study area identify themselves as non-White, non-Hispanic
- 15% identify themselves as Black, non-Hispanic
- 10% identify themselves as Asian, non-Hispanic
- 24% identify themselves as Hispanic or Latino
- 27% of the study area are low-income (at twice the Federal poverty threshold)

Public outreach activities for the Environmental Assessment process were designed to include coordination with elected officials and community leaders; environmental justice webinar-style community meetings; and the establishment of an Environmental Justice Technical Advisory Group and an Environmental Justice Stakeholder Working Group.

The purpose of the Environmental Justice Stakeholder Working Group was to provide a forum for people within the environmental justice communities who would like to share concerns and ideas, or want to know more about particular issues. The purpose of the Environmental Justice Technical Advisory Group was to help identify concerns of those in environmental justice communities, propose mitigation if needed, and help circulate information as widely as possible.

Nine virtual meetings focusing on environmental justice communities were held; three each for relevant counties in New York, New Jersey, and Connecticut, as were eight meetings of the Environmental Justice Technical Advisory Group and four meetings of the Environmental Justice Stakeholder Working Group.

For information on the effects on environmental justice communities and populations, please see [Chapter 17, "Environmental Justice"](#) of the Final EA.